

GETTYSBURG JULY 1<sup>1</sup>REVIEWED BY MAJOR JERRETT W. DUNLAP, JR.<sup>2</sup>

*Hundreds of the Confederates fell at the first volley, plainly marking their line with a ghastly row of dead and wounded men, whose blood trailed the course of their line with a crimson stain clearly discernable for several days after the battle, until the rain washed the gory record away.*<sup>3</sup>

Dr. David G. Martin's epic account of the first day of the Civil War's most decisive battle<sup>4</sup> ensures that neither rain nor time itself will wash away the heroic acts of 1 July 1863. Dr. Martin undertakes to write "the most detailed account of the first day's battle yet written."<sup>5</sup> He also attempts to investigate the numerous controversies surrounding day one of the battle.<sup>6</sup> Dr. Martin proposes that "the decisive battle between Lee and Meade could have occurred anywhere between York, [Pennsylvania], and Frederick, [Maryland]."<sup>7</sup> He concludes that the battle occurred at Gettysburg on 1 July 1863 due to "specific decisions" of the commanding generals in the days immediately prior to, as well as the morning of, the battle.<sup>8</sup> Dr. Martin's narrative is an exhaustive work that marches through each aspect of the battle with painstaking detail. The result is a resource that belongs in all devoted Civil War students' reference collection. *Gettysburg July 1* also serves as a useful text for a judge advocate officer leadership development program (LDP), because of its descriptions of the leadership styles, examples, and decisions of the battle's prominent leaders. Ultimately, a thorough reading of *Gettysburg July 1* leaves the reader with an intimate familiarity of day one of the battle, its leaders, and the heroic struggle of the tens of thousands of brave American Soldiers who fought that day, which time cannot wash away.

---

<sup>1</sup> DAVID G. MARTIN, *GETTYSBURG JULY 1* (First Da Capo Press ed., 2003) (1995).

<sup>2</sup> U.S. Army. Written while assigned as a student, 54th Judge Advocate Officer Graduate Course, The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, U.S. Army, Charlottesville, Virginia.

<sup>3</sup> MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 236 (quoting JOHN D. VAUTIER, *HISTORY OF THE 88TH PENNSYLVANIA VOLUNTEERS IN THE WAR FOR THE UNION, 1861-1865* 135 (1894)).

<sup>4</sup> *See id.* at 9.

<sup>5</sup> *Id.* at 10.

<sup>6</sup> *See id.*

<sup>7</sup> *Id.*

<sup>8</sup> *Id.*

### Foundations

Dr. Martin dedicated *Gettysburg July 1* to his mother and father, “who fostered and nourished [his] passion for history from the beginning.”<sup>9</sup> It is clear that passion forms the foundation of such a well-researched and thorough narrative. Dr. Martin states that he has been “longing” to write this book since adulthood.<sup>10</sup> This work is not his first foray into historical authorship, however. He received a Ph.D. from Princeton University and has authored over twenty books on the Civil War and the Revolutionary War.<sup>11</sup> His stellar credentials and detailed research and analysis, combined with a passion for history, all result in a professional reference book about the first day of battle at Gettysburg that a student of the Civil War can turn to again and again.

*Gettysburg July 1* is not for the uninitiated Civil War historian or those lacking an understanding of the battle. It contains 736 pages, 2,652 endnotes, and an eighteen-page bibliography detailing the hundreds of sources relied upon.<sup>12</sup> Dr. Martin puts the battle at Gettysburg under the microscope again and again. He describes all aspects of the battle, to include an analysis of the terrain, the number and disposition of troops, orders and guidance from leaders, quotations and personal accounts of the battle, and casualties.<sup>13</sup> Although this level of detail may not be appropriate for readers desiring an overview of the battle,<sup>14</sup> it is fitting for more serious students of the battle. He also analyzes numerous major and minor controversies throughout the book,<sup>15</sup> many of them well

---

<sup>9</sup> *Id.* at 5.

<sup>10</sup> *Id.* at 6.

<sup>11</sup> See Longstreet House, <http://www.longstreethouse.com/author.html#dm> (last visited Dec. 2, 2005) (describing Dr. Martin’s biography).

<sup>12</sup> See MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at back cover (indicating that the sources are “primary, first-hand sources, many of which are unpublished and some of which have never been cited before.”).

<sup>13</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 102-40 (using thirty-eight pages and 225 endnotes to address the twenty-five minute fight between Brigadier General (BG) Lysander Cutler’s brigade and BG Joseph R. Davis’ brigade).

<sup>14</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 11-12 (providing an overview of General (GEN) Robert E. Lee’s summer offensive into Pennsylvania in only two paragraphs). Given the small amount of background information provided, Dr. Martin clearly assumes that the reader has at least a moderate level of familiarity with the Civil War.

<sup>15</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 97 (meeting between Major General (MG) John F. Reynolds and BG John Buford at the Seminary); *id.* at 105-06 (separation of 147th New York from the 76th New York and the 56th Pennsylvania); *id.* at 138 (number of Confederate prisoners taken during BG Davis’ attack at the Railroad Cut); *id.* at 145-49 (direction of the shot that

known to students of the battle. He first describes the nature of each controversy, then examines multiple accounts describing the facts surrounding the controversy, and finally compares and discusses which version is most reliable.<sup>16</sup> Dr. Martin's analysis is always well documented, balanced, and reaches a logical result. Given his impeccable qualifications and research, it is certainly difficult to argue with his conclusions, which always appear to be reasonable. The examination of these controversies, when combined with the detailed treatment of the battle, provides interesting information that should appeal to serious students of the battle. Nevertheless, this may prove to be more than a Gettysburg neophyte bargained for.

Dr. Martin lays the foundation for the battle by providing specific information regarding to the location and movement of GEN Robert E. Lee's Army of Northern Virginia beginning on 26 June 1863.<sup>17</sup> He then discusses in detail GEN Lee's strategic objective, namely to locate and defeat the Army of the Potomac.<sup>18</sup> The discussion includes numerous sources to establish GEN Lee's intent, which was to concentrate the bulk of his forces against portions of Major General (MG) George G. Meade's forces,<sup>19</sup> while avoiding a "pitched battle as the aggressor."<sup>20</sup> Dr. Martin also provides a similar description of the location and movements of MG Meade's Army of the Potomac and his objectives.<sup>21</sup> Major General

---

killed MG Reynolds); *id.* at 160 (disposition of BG James J. Archer's sword); *id.* at 291-96 (meeting between BG Francis C. Barlow and BG J. B. Gordon (*see infra* note 31)).

<sup>16</sup> *See, e.g., id.* at 59-67. Not only is Chapter III entitled *Opening Shots*, but it describes the numerous accounts surrounding who fired the first shot of the battle.

<sup>17</sup> *See id.* at 12.

<sup>18</sup> *See id.* at 16.

<sup>19</sup> Major General Meade took command of the Army of the Potomac upon the relief of MG Joseph Hooker on 28 June 1863. *See id.* at 33-36.

<sup>20</sup> *Id.* at 17; *see also id.* at 17 and 596 n.25 (quoting Letter from MG Isaac R. Trimble to John B. Bachelder (Feb. 8, 1883) (on file with the N.H. Hist. Soc'y) (indicating GEN Lee told MG Trimble of his intention to "throw an overwhelming force against the enemy's advance," in a conversation with on the afternoon of 25 June 1863); MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 17 (quoting GEN Robert E. Lee, The Gettysburg Campaign Report (Jan. 20, 1864), in 27 WAR OF THE REBELLION: A COMPILATION OF THE OFFICIAL RECORDS OF THE UNION AND CONFEDERATE ARMIES, pt. 2 at 313, 318 (Gov't Print. Off., 1889), available at <http://cdl.library.cornell.edu/moa/browse.monographs/waro.html> (last visited Jan. 9, 2006) [hereinafter WAR OF THE REBELLION] ("It had not been intended to deliver a pitched battle so far from our base unless attacked."); *id.* at 17-18 (quoting Letter from Lieutenant General (LTG) James Longstreet to MG Lafayette McLaws (July 25, 1873) (Lafayette McLaws Papers on file with S. Hist. Collection, Univ. of N.C., Chapel Hill), available at <http://www.lib.unc.edu/mss/inv/m/McLaws,Lafayette.html> (stating the intended campaign would be "one of offensive strategy, but defensive tactics.")).

<sup>21</sup> MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 33-43.

Meade indicated his intention was to move north after crossing the Potomac in the direction of the Susquehanna, “keeping Washington and Baltimore well covered, and if the enemy is checked in his attempt to cross the Susquehanna, or if he turns to Baltimore, to give him battle.”<sup>22</sup> While Dr. Martin’s description of the road to the battle and the commanders’ intentions clearly provides the reader with a solid foundation about the position of the two armies and the objectives of their commanders, and presents a persuasive case in support of Dr. Martin’s thesis regarding where the battle could have occurred, it is in no way a primer for readers who are not familiar with the history of the war leading up to the dramatic battle at Gettysburg.<sup>23</sup>

### The Union Carries the Morning

After setting the stage for the battle, Dr. Martin describes the opening encounter between Brigadier General (BG) John Buford’s Union Cavalry troopers and the Confederate Soldiers of MG Henry Heth’s Division, a part of Lieutenant General (LTG) A. P. Hill’s Third Army Corps.<sup>24</sup> After describing the position and movement of MG Heth’s brigades, he provides a similar explanation of the deployment of BG Buford’s two Cavalry brigades along McPherson’s Ridge and the strategy and weaponry he employed.<sup>25</sup> Dr. Martin then gives a compelling and detailed description of the brawl between BG Buford’s cavalrymen and MG Heth’s infantrymen.<sup>26</sup> Throughout *Gettysburg July 1*, Dr. Martin effectively uses maps to illustrate unit positions, movements, and region topography.<sup>27</sup> Dr. Martin positions the maps within the chapters at regular intervals.<sup>28</sup> When combined with the detailed minute-by-minute description of unit location and movement, the maps allow the reader to clearly visualize the development of the battle. The narrative describes the arrival of MG Reynolds, Commander of the Union Army’s left wing, followed by BG Lysander Cutler’s brigade and BG Solomon Meredith’s Iron Brigade, as well as the ensuing

---

<sup>22</sup> *Id.* at 37 (quoting Telegram from MG George Meade to MG Henry Halleck (June 28, 1863), in *WAR OF THE REBELLION*, *supra* note 20, pt. 1, at 61).

<sup>23</sup> *See supra* notes 7-8 and accompanying text.

<sup>24</sup> *See* MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 59-88.

<sup>25</sup> *See id.* at 69-82.

<sup>26</sup> *See id.* at 82-88.

<sup>27</sup> *See id.* at 8 for an index of maps.

<sup>28</sup> *See, e.g., id.* maps 10, 11, and 12 (depicting Early’s attack at 1515 hours and 1530 hours, and Coster’s Last Stand at 1545).

fight during the morning between these Union brigades and the Confederate brigades of BG James J. Archer and BG Joseph R. Davis.<sup>29</sup> He fills the account of this struggle with compelling examples of personal bravery to reinforce the tremendous sacrifices made by the brave Soldiers in both factions.<sup>30</sup>

His organization addresses the battle chronologically, by unit composition, position and action, and then by subject matter.<sup>31</sup> This method provides an orderly, thorough narrative. However, occasionally this method results in Dr. Martin covering the same material more than once.<sup>32</sup> It also requires Dr. Martin to refer to an earlier time period as he shifts from one unit to another, if the action and subject matter throw off his chronology.<sup>33</sup> Although Dr. Martin's organizational style provides some distraction, it does not significantly detract from the work as a whole. In fact, it only reinforces the conclusion that *Gettysburg July 1* is most useful as a reference work.<sup>34</sup> The reader can refer to a specific

---

<sup>29</sup> See *id.* at 89-102.

<sup>30</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 115 (depicting a 76th New York Soldier's dedication to duty); see also *id.* at 117 (describing the "true Irish grit" of Sergeant (SGT) William A. Wybourn, 147th New York, as he saved the Regimental Colors (quoting N.Y. MONUMENTS COMMISSION FOR THE BATTLEFIELDS OF GETTYSBURG AND CHATTANOOGA, FINAL REPORT ON THE BATTLEFIELD OF GETTYSBURG 993 (1902) (citing Cooley, *Cutler's Brigade*, NAT'L TRIB. (July 17, 1915))).

<sup>31</sup> For example, Chapter VII, *Collapse of the XI Corps*, begins by describing XI Corps' arrival on the battlefield and deployment north of Gettysburg beginning around 1200 hours. Dr. Martin describes the deployment of each division and brigade, regiment by regiment. He then describes the move of BG Barlow's First Division, XI Corps, to Blocher's Knoll. Next, he outlines the assault of MG Jubal A. Early's division against Barlow's division, and the collapse of BG Barlow's division. Finally, he describes and analyzes the controversy surrounding the encounter of BG J. B. Gordon with the then wounded BG Barlow, and the history related to that controversy. After concluding this analysis, Dr. Martin moves on to the collapse of another unit in XI Corps, i.e., Colonel Wladimir Krzyzanowski's brigade. See MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 257-96.

<sup>32</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 109-10, 459 (describing in two separate sections the same account of SGT Henry Cliff, Company F, 76th New York, and his suffering after being wounded.) Incidentally, this account fits nicely into a discussion of obligations regarding the treatment of wounded on the battlefield as a part of a judge advocate officer LDP. See *infra* note 44 and accompanying text.

<sup>33</sup> See, e.g., *id.* at 140-49 (shifting from the fight between BG Cutler's brigade and BG Davis' brigade from 1020 to 1115 hours, to MG Reynolds' death at approximately 1030 hours, then again to the fighting between the Iron Brigade and BG Archer's brigade, which took place at approximately the same time as the Cutler-Davis fight).

<sup>34</sup> Further reference tools contained in *Gettysburg July 1* are found in the appendices, which are excellent sources of information. They include an order of battle of all Union and Confederate commanders, down to the regimental level, who were involved on 1 July 1863. See *id.* at 570-80. Appendix II contains strength and casualty data. See *id.* at 581.

section or topic and receive a complete, detailed analysis of that section, without having to refer to other sections.

### The Tide Turns

Dr. Martin describes the arrival of MG Oliver O. Howard's XI Corps and its deployment and ultimate collapse in his usual detail, including the many controversies surrounding its implosion.<sup>35</sup> Although not as well known as some other assaults on 2 or 3 July 1863, this was some of the fiercest fighting of the battle. Dr. Martin documents this with compelling empirical data.<sup>36</sup> However, the personal accounts of the battle that he recites again and again provide the most compelling account of the ferocity of the combat.<sup>37</sup> *Gettysburg July 1* also details the retreat of MG Abner Doubleday's I Corps after its determined stand on McPherson's ridge, and again on Seminary ridge.<sup>38</sup>

### Prelude to Days Two and Three

The final chapter in *Gettysburg July 1* describes the decisions surrounding the regrouping of Union forces on and around Cemetery Hill after the chaotic retreats of I and XI Corps and the Confederate forces' failure to attack.<sup>39</sup> This chapter contains Dr. Martin's analysis of the decisions made by both Union and Confederate leaders that set the stage for the battle on days two and three. Dr. Martin begins by describing the decisions MG Howard made after he succeeded the late MG Reynolds as

---

There is also a detailed topographical appendix, as well as a chronological and meteorological index. *See id.* at 582-91. Finally, there are tables of Medal of Honor winners and battery armaments from day one. *See id.* at 592-93.

<sup>35</sup> *See id.* at 167-335.

<sup>36</sup> *See, e.g., id.* at 315 (calculating total casualties in BG Coster's brigade to be 83.5 percent, the highest percentage casualty rate of any Union unit in the battle); *see also id.* at 236 (recounting casualties of BG Alfred Iverson's brigade at sixty-five percent, including the 23d North Carolina, which suffered casualties of eighty-nine percent). Brigadier General Iverson's brigade's casualties were as bad as those of MG George E. Pickett's division on 3 July 1863. *See id.* at 236.

<sup>37</sup> *See, e.g., id.* at 322 (describing the heroics of CPT Francis Irsch, 45th New York, who was awarded the Medal of Honor). The eight Medals of Honor awarded for action on 1 July 1863 are in Appendix V. *See id.* at 592.

<sup>38</sup> *See id.* at 342-466.

<sup>39</sup> *See id.* at 467-569.

Union Commander.<sup>40</sup> He then analyzes MG Winfield S. Hancock's impact on the Union forces as they regrouped on Cemetery Hill,<sup>41</sup> and examines some of GEN Lee's decisions and mistakes in battle.<sup>42</sup> Finally, Dr. Martin considers MG Henry W. Slocum's decisions in leading the nearly 10,000 man XII Corps.<sup>43</sup> The final chapter is a significant departure in style from the preceding chapters of *Gettysburg July 1*. Whereas the majority of the narrative focuses on the heated action of the battle, the final section takes place as the fighting of day one draws to a close and the leaders' decisions take center stage for determining the remainder of the battle. This section may be the most interesting as Dr. Martin describes the various leadership styles at play and shows how those leadership styles have made a direct impact on history.

### Leadership Lessons

The detailed examination of the four generals' leadership styles is ideal for use in the LDP. A staff judge advocate could assign subordinate officers to read the different accounts and draw lessons learned from the leadership styles. For example, the program could take place over four separate sessions, with all officers reading the materials, and one officer leading the discussion about a different general each week. Another option would be to assign four judge advocates to role-play the four named generals. The actors would then describe their leadership styles and participate in a debate between the four generals on the decisions they made. As *Gettysburg July 1* is so full of individual accounts directly relevant to judge advocates, it is fertile ground for harvesting many valuable examples and lessons related to the practice of military law.<sup>44</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup> See *id.* at 467-73.

<sup>41</sup> See *id.* at 478-95.

<sup>42</sup> See *id.* at 498-514.

<sup>43</sup> See *id.* at 523-41.

<sup>44</sup> See, e.g., MARTIN, *supra* note 1, at 53 (Union commanders given authority to order instant death for Soldiers derelict in their duties); see also *id.* at 163 (treatment of BG Archer as a prisoner of war); *id.* at 316 (treatment of prisoners of war); *id.* at 233, 290, 314-15, 350-53 (valor in protecting the colors); *id.* at 112-13, 220, 288, 468 (friction of war).

### Conclusion

*Gettysburg July 1* is certain to remain a classic study of this important battle in American history for years to come. Its true value lies in its in-depth research and keen analysis of the battle as well as the many controversies surrounding 1 July 1863.<sup>45</sup> Dr. Martin shows how the commanders' decisions, together with their leadership styles, had a direct impact on when and where the two armies fought the battle.<sup>46</sup> This narrative belongs on the shelf of all Civil War students. As such, it will ensure that the record of the brave Union and Confederate Soldiers will not wash away with time.<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>45</sup> *See id.* at 10.

<sup>46</sup> *See id.*

<sup>47</sup> *See supra* note 3 and accompanying text.